

© This discussion paper was prepared under the EduLaw project (573540-EPP-1-2016-1-BE-EPPKA2-CBHE-JP) funded by the European Commission. The European Commission support for the project does not constitute an endorsement of the content which reflects the views only of the authors. Please cite this discussion paper as: UT EduLaw team, EduLaw discussion paper, (add title and authors).

LEGISLATING THE QUALITY IN EDUCATION

Prepared by

Nikoleta Mita & Livia Nano

TABLE OF CONTENTS

LEARNING OUTCOMES

INTRODUCTION

CHAPTER I: UNDERSTANDING QUALITY OF EDUCATION

- 1.1. Different understandings of quality
- 1.2. Quality education for all as a human right issue

CHAPTER II: INTERNATIONAL LEGAL FRAMEWORK ON QUALITY EDUCATION

CHAPTER III: NATIONAL LEGAL FRAMEWORKS ON QUALITY IN EDUCATION

- 3.1. Quality of inputs
 - 3.1.1. Quality of school environment
 - 3.1.2. Quality of curriculum
 - 3.1.3. Quality of teachers
- 3.2. Quality of results
 - 3.2.1. Evaluation of learning achievements

CHAPTER IV: EVALUATION OF QUALITY IN PRE-UNIVERSITY EDUCATION

-
- 4.1. External evaluation of schools
 - 4.2. Internal evaluation of schools

CASES

REQUIRED READINGS

SUGESTED READINGS AND RESOURCES

LEARNING OUTCOMES

On completion of this module, the students will be able:

- To demonstrate knowledge and understanding of the legal framework that is relevant to quality in education.
- To demonstrate understanding of impact of legal framework in implementing and assuring quality of education in the international, national level and institutional level.
- To analyse similarities and differences of the legal frameworks implemented in different countries towards quality of education.
- To identify and articulate clearly the legal and administrative issues in a factual scenario from quality education field.
- To analyse and prepare briefs of significant legal cases, case studies, secondary materials and classroom studies on quality education issues.
- To assess the enforcement of legal framework on quality of education.
- To demonstrate professional judgment and professionalism through conduct consistent with the legal and teaching profession's values and standards.
- To speak in a clear, organized, and professional manner on legal dimension of quality in education.

INTRODUCTION

We live in a rapidly changing and increasingly interdependent world where knowledge and innovation are major drivers of development. This means good quality education and learning are becoming even more important determinants of the well-being of individuals, the progress of countries and the quality of humanity's common future.

Educational scientists, policy makers, school leaders, teachers, educational lawyers and all others working in and around education across the globe are interested in the quality of education and are often faced with issues of monitoring the quality of education in a manner that is locally relevant.

The focus of this module is the legislating the quality in the pre-university education. The module is intended to present in a comparative way the legal frameworks (international and national) that support and regulate the implementation of a quality education in a certain context and to analyse cases from the field. Information included in this module is gathered from the international legal documents, from national laws and by laws of Albania, Belarus, Belgium, Lithuania, Poland, and Russia, and the cases selected from the education context of the mentioned countries. Learning of education legislation on quality in education will help students to understand the impact of legal framework in implementing and assuring quality of education in the international, national and institutional level.

CHAPTER I: UNDERSTANDING QUALITY IN EDUCATION

1.1. Different understandings of quality

Quality is a complex and multi-dimensional concept. Many sectors have debated how to define quality.

Historically, the concept of quality evolved from the manufacturing sector. Chambers dictionary defines quality both as “grade of goodness” and as “excellence”. This indicates the ambiguity in its meaning: namely, that it can mean both “good” and “how good”.

Webster’s dictionary describes quality, as a “degree of excellence” and “superiority in kind”.

The *Oxford English Dictionary* (OED) gives similar definitions – the “degree of excellence of a thing”, “general excellence” and “of high quality”. ‘Degree of excellence’ implies that you can talk about something of good quality or poor in quality.

Such ambiguity leads to many interpretations. It is therefore necessary to describe what is meant by the term in any particular context.

In the recent educational theory and practice the concept of quality has been used frequently, but has not been defined frequently insomuch.

Literature on the quality of education often covers very broad concepts. Mialaret's (1985) general definition emphasizes that the quality of education is reflected in the fit between, on the one hand, the expectations of society expressed in the general and specific objectives of education, and, on the other, the actual characteristics of the educational process and the changes observed at the student level. According to Grisay and Mahlck (1991)¹ the general concept of educational quality is composed of three interrelated dimensions: the quality of human and material resources available for teaching (inputs), the quality of teaching practices (process) and quality of the results (outputs and outcomes).

The meaning of [educational] quality is grounded in values, cultures and traditions; it may be specific to a given nation, province, community, school, parent, or individual student. Even if there is lack of agreement on what quality is there often is agreement that it should be approved (Adams, 1993)

Any definition of quality must be defined in terms of the context in which it is used. No one’s perspective of quality may be good by itself. All the concepts above (and others) are valuable. However, when an educational institution or a Quality Assurance Agency chooses a particular definition, it must be clearly specified.

For the purposes of this module, the definition of quality education is based on the *Recommendation CM/Rec(2012)13 of the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe to member States on ensuring quality education*². According to this document “quality education” is understood as education which:

- a. gives access to learning to all pupils and students, particularly those in vulnerable or disadvantaged groups, adapted to their needs as appropriate;
- b. provides a secure and non-violent learning environment in which the rights of all are respected;
- c. develops each pupil’s and student’s personality, talents and mental and physical abilities to their fullest potential and encourages them to complete the educational programs in which they enrol;
- d. promotes democracy, respect for human rights and social justice in a learning environment which recognizes everyone’s learning and social needs;

¹ Grisay & Mahlck (1991). The quality of education in developing countries: a review of some research studies and policy documents.

² Recommendation CM/Rec(2012)13 of the Committee of Ministers to member States on ensuring quality education (Adopted by the Committee of Ministers on 12 December 2012 at the 1158th meeting of the Ministers’ Deputies)

-
- e. enables pupils and students to develop appropriate competences, self-confidence and critical thinking to help them become responsible citizens and improve their employability;
 - f. passes on universal and local cultural values to pupils and students while equipping them also to make their own decisions;
 - g. certifies outcomes of formal and non-formal learning in a transparent way based on fair assessment enabling acquired knowledge and competences to be recognized for further study, employment and other purposes;
 - h. relies on qualified teachers who are committed to continuous professional development;
 - i. is free of corruption.

For the practical purposes, the legal information in this module is structured based on three interrelated dimensions: the quality of input (quality of human and material resources available for teaching: school environment, curriculum, quality of teachers), the quality of process (instruction quality) and quality of the results (learning achievement).

1.2. Quality education for all as a human right issue

The goal of a human rights-based approach to education is: to assure every child a quality education that respects and promotes her or his right to dignity and optimum development.

The human rights-based approach to education is based on conceptual framework that addresses the 1) right of access to education, 2) the right to quality education and 3) respect for human rights in education. These three dimensions are interdependent and interlinked, and a rights-based education necessitates the realization of all three aspects:

1) *The right of access to education* – the right of every child to education on the basis of equality of opportunity and without discrimination on any grounds. To achieve this goal, education must be available for, accessible to and inclusive of all children.

2) *The right to quality education* – the right of every child to a quality education that enables him or her to fulfil his or her potential, realize opportunities for employment and develop life skills. To achieve this goal, education needs to be child-centred, relevant and embrace a broad curriculum, and be appropriately resourced and monitored.

3) *The right to respect within the learning environment* – the right of every child to respect for her or his inherent dignity and to have her or his universal human rights respected within the education system. To achieve this goal, education must be provided in a way that is consistent with human rights, including equal respect for every child, opportunities for meaningful participation, freedom from all forms of violence, and respect for language, culture and religion.

CHAPTER II: INTERNATIONAL LEGAL FRAMEWORK ON QUALITY EDUCATION

Normative international and regional instruments lay down the obligations of the states regarding the quality in education. These instruments promote and develop the right of every person to enjoy access to a good quality education without discrimination or exclusion. It is for the governments of the states to fulfil their obligations, both legal and political, in regards to providing a good quality education for all and to implement and monitor more effectively education strategies. A number of international legal documents regulate and support the implementation of the quality education.

Universal Declaration of Human Rights, 1948

Article 26.2 of the Declaration clearly states that education must be “directed to the full development of the human personality and to the strengthening of respect for human rights and fundamental freedoms.”

International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, 1966

Article 13.1 specifies that education “shall enable all persons to participate effectively in a free society, promote understanding, tolerance and friendship among all nations and all racial, ethnic or religious groups, and further the activities of the United Nations for the maintenance of peace.”

2. The States Parties to the present Covenant recognise that, with a view to achieving the full realisation of this right:

(e) The development of a system of schools at all levels shall be actively pursued, an adequate fellowship system shall be established, and the material conditions of teaching staff shall be continuously improved.

4. No part of this article shall be construed so as to interfere with the liberty of individuals and bodies to establish and direct educational institutions, subject always to the observance of the principles set forth in paragraph I of this article and to the requirement that the education given in such institutions shall conform to such *minimum standards* as may be laid down by the State.

Convention on the Rights of the Child, 1989

Article 29.1 of the Convention on the Rights of the Child goes further in stipulating that education must develop respect for human rights, the child's parents, his or her own cultural identity, language and values, for the national values of the country in which the child is living, the country from which he or she may originate, and for civilizations different from his or her own. Education must prepare the child for responsible life in a free society.

2. No part of the present article or article 28 shall be construed so as to interfere with the liberty of individuals and bodies to establish and direct educational institutions, subject always to the observance of the principle set forth in paragraph 1 of the present article and to the requirements that the education given in such institutions shall conform to such *minimum standards* as may be laid down by the State.

Convention on the Elimination of All Form of Discrimination Against Women, 1979

State' obligations to ensure quality education for girls is further expounded in the *Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women*, which establishes women's right to education, both as entitlement and as empowerment. State parties thus have an obligation to ensure, on the basis of equality of men and women, access to education at all levels and in all its forms, including “access to the same curricula, the same examinations, teaching staff with qualifications of the same standard and school premises and equipment of the same quality” (art. 10 (b)).

The UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education (1960), the first legally binding international instrument in the field of education, makes explicit reference to the obligation to ensure quality in education: “the term ‘education’ refers to all types and levels of education, and includes access to education, the standard and quality of education, and the conditions under which it is given” (art.1, para.2). States have an obligation to lay down a uniform framework of quality standards applicable throughout the country. The Convention provides the basis for combating disparities in education and ensuring equal opportunities which involve ensuring quality for all (art.2 (a)).

The UNESCO-ILO Recommendation concerning the Status of Teachers (1966) provides a comprehensive normative framework on teachers' status, including their responsibilities, career advancement opportunities, security of tenure and conditions of service.

Dakar Framework for Action – Education for All: Meeting our Collective Commitment, 2000. Adopted in 2000 by the World Education Forum, the Dakar Frameworks for Action sets the six EFA goals to be achieved by 2015. Goal 6 refers to the quality of education. States committed to improve all aspects of the quality of education and to ensure excellence of all so that recognised and measurable learning outcomes are achieved by all, especially in literacy, numeracy and essential life skills. The Dakar Framework further specifies that 'assessment of learning should include an evaluation of environments, processes and outcomes'. Measuring the quality of education thus demands much more than only assessing outcomes. It also requires reviewing these elements referred to as 'processes' and 'environments', such as the school infrastructure, teaching methods and materials, a relevant curriculum, and other factors. These processes and environments may largely constitute determinants of learning outcomes, i.e. better environments and processes should theoretically lead to better learning outcomes. Well-designed learning outcomes targets and assessments may help to capture some of these dimensions. However, this is not automatic, and therefore States should monitor these processes and environments outside of learning outcomes assessments.

African Youth Charter, 2006 African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child, 1990, art. 11, 7 states that the education given in such institutions shall conform to such *minimum standards* as may be laid down by the States. *Article 13.1.* Every young person shall have the right to education of good quality.

Council of Europe Recommendation on Ensuring Quality Education, 2012³. The Council of Europe has developed a recommendation on the right to quality. This instrument enriches existing regional and national norms and principles in the field of education. The Committee of Ministers, under the terms of Article 15.b of the Statute of the Council of Europe, gives recommendation.

The recommendation aims to ensure quality education for all individuals and to define the role of public authorities in making this a reality.

The recommendation recognizes that for this to occur, quality education and the responsibility of public authorities to ensure it should be adapted to the requirements of modern, complex societies. Public authorities should include quality education as a prominent element of their policies.

The recommendation covers all areas and levels of formal education within national education systems and aims at ensuring quality education for all members of society, while recognizing that access to formal education may be given on the basis of qualifications obtained through informal and non-formal learning.

While general in scope, the recommendation recognizes that in the case of some individuals and groups, including those whose medical, social, economic or other conditions put them at particular disadvantage, special measures may be required to ensure quality education.

³ Recommendation CM/Rec(2012)13 of the Committee of Ministers to member States on ensuring quality education (Adopted by the Committee of Ministers on 12 December 2012 at the 1158th meeting of the Ministers' Deputies)

Public authorities have the responsibility for ensuring the quality of all education offered as a part of the national education system, regardless of whether it is public or private.

General provisions aiming to ensure quality education

Compulsory education

12. Without exception, all school-age children should have the right and the obligation to take part in quality education, through public or private provision. Public compulsory education should be free of charge and all parents or legal guardians should have the right and the duty to enrol their children in the system. Where parents or legal guardians fail to enrol their children in school, public authorities should have the responsibility and the means to ensure the children's right to quality education.

Non-compulsory secondary education

16. Where all or part of upper-secondary education is not compulsory, public authorities should endeavour to provide quality secondary education opportunities for all those interested, commensurate with their aspirations and abilities. Where, for valid reasons, this is not possible, public authorities should endeavour to provide alternatives which correspond as closely as possible to the students' preferred option(s).

Private education provision

20. Both public and private provision may be a part of national education systems. In all cases, public authorities are responsible for the national education system, for setting the general framework within which education is provided and for ensuring its quality.

21. For all stages of education, whether compulsory or non-compulsory, parents and legal guardians should have the right to enroll their children in private educational institutions and programs which meet the standards and requirements stipulated by public authorities.

Learning paths and qualifications frameworks

25. In developing and implementing their national qualifications frameworks, public authorities should ensure that they provide for the possibility for pupils and students to modify their education pathways without undue loss of time and repetition of learning already acquired. Public authorities should fully explore the potential of qualifications frameworks to allow pupils and students, as well as those engaged in informal and non-formal education, to follow different learning paths towards qualifications and, more broadly, as instruments facilitating quality education.

Measures for vulnerable groups

26. Quality education should seek to be inclusive. Public authorities have the responsibility for ensuring quality education also for those who are unable to make successful use of mainstream education programs for very diverse reasons, which range from lack of proficiency in the language(s) of instruction or substantial differences in previous educational curricula to severe mental or physical disability.

Recommendation of the European Parliament and of the Council of 12 February 2001 on European cooperation in quality evaluation in school education, OJ C 60, 1.3.2001 states that member states within their specific economic, social and cultural context while taking due account of the European dimension should support the improvement of quality evaluation in school education by 1. supporting and, where appropriate, establishing transparent quality evaluation system; by 2. encouraging and supporting, where appropriate, the involvement of school stakeholders, including teachers, pupils, management, parents and experts, in the

process of external and self-evaluation in schools in order to promote shared responsibility for the improvement of schools; by 3. supporting training in the management and the use of self-evaluation instruments; by 4. supporting the capacity of schools to learn from one another nationally and on a European scale; encouraging cooperation between all the authorities involved in quality evaluation in school education and promoting their European networking.

The UN Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights recognizes quality as a key component of the right to education: “education offered must be adequate in quality, relevant to the child and must promote the realization of the child's other rights.”⁴

In their dialogue with States parties, human rights treaty bodies further concretized State obligations and political commitments to ensure quality of education. The Committee developed different indicators to measure whether, and if so how, States comply with the quality requirement. The treaty bodies have expressed concern about under-resourcing of schools, class sizes and teacher/pupil ratios, proportion of untrained teachers and their impact on the quality of education received.⁵ In terms of monitoring the teaching and learning process, the Committee on the Rights of the Child noted the narrow content of education provided within schools and the lack of supervision of their curricula.⁶ The treaty bodies also used students’ learning outcomes, such as low literacy rates, as indicative of limitations of the quality of education provided.⁷

CHAPTER III: NATIONAL LEGAL FRAMEWORKS ON QUALITY IN EDUCATION

3.1. Overview of the national legal frameworks on quality in education

Making the right to quality education a reality for all is an absolute priority and this cannot be achieved without strong national legal and policy frameworks. The right to quality education is provided in national legislation in many countries, effectively demonstrating how international obligations can be reflected in the domestic legal order. Quality in education is an emerging concern in recent reforms of national education systems. These reforms often include the adoption of laws and decrees that set specific rules and regulations for the promotion of quality in education. States have developed a variety of instruments to promote standards for quality in education, sometimes with technical assistance, ranging from laws to policies and programs. Below is presented the legal framework on quality of education of six countries: Albania, Belarus, Belgium, Lithuania, Poland and Russia. From the comparative analysis it is noted that the six countries have drafted quality education issues in the domestic legislation based on international legislation and their constitutions. Belgium (Flemish Community) has a special decree on quality in education, while other countries include quality issues under the education law. All countries use bylaw documents issued by the

⁴ See the Committee’s general comment No. 11 (1999), para. 6.

⁵ See, for example, CRC/C/15/Add.225, para. 55; CRC/C/MDV/CO/3, para. 81; E/C.12/IND/CO/5, para. 41; E/C.12/LVA/CO/1, para. 55; E/C.12/1/Add.47, para. 17; E/C.12/1/Add.65, para. 17; E/C.12/1/Add.68, para. 47.

⁶ CRC/C/15/Add.221, para. 64.

⁷ CRC/C/15/Add.223, para. 62; E/C.12/1/Add.74, para. 28; E/C.12/1/Add.75, para. 32.

government and the ministry of education. All countries have covered the key topics related to quality education.

Albania

The principles, responsibilities and procedures for quality in education are provided in a number of law and bylaw documents. The main legal documents include the following.

*The Law no.69/2012, amended, "On Pre-University Education System in the Republic of Albania"*⁸ is the main legal document for education. Articles 6, 25, 27, 28, 30, 38, 40, 44, 45, 48, 49, 50, 51, 52, 54, 56, 57, 61, 62, 63, 65 of this law state the right of every student to quality education, included the right of the disable children to quality education; the requirements to the quality of curriculum and textbooks; the criteria to the quality of teachers; rules on student assessment; the right of students, educational employees, parents to express their views concerning the quality of the educational service and obligation of educational institution to hear their views on quality education; the responsibility of the State Inspectorate of Education for evaluating the quality of educational service based on indicators; the responsibility of school principal for the quality education; the responsibility of the basic unit of local governance for improvement of the quality of educational service for all the students in public pre-university educational institutions.

*The Law no.8872, date 29.03.2002, amended in 2008, 2011 "On professional education and formation in the Republic of Albania" (articles 4, 9, 13, 18, 19, 24, 24/1)*⁹ contains rules on accreditation of the programs of professional education and formation; on student assessment; on evaluation of the system of professional education and formation.

*Normative provisions for the pre university education system (2013)*¹⁰ is a bylaw document issued by the Ministry of Education and Sciences in 2013 that contains a set of rules related to the quality in education (articles: 6, 14, 15, 17, 18, 19, 20, 21, 30, 31, 32, 33, 35, 55, 67, 68, 69, 70, 103, 104, 105, 106, 107, 108, 109, 111, 112, 115, 122, 123, 128, 129, 130, 131, 132). Rules are focused on school environments requirements, on student assessment, on rights and responsibilities of educational institutions and bodies on quality in education.

Belarus

The legal framework on quality in education in Belarus is composed by the following official documents. These documents contain rules and provisions on quality of education in general, on quality of education environment, curricula, teachers, on responsibilities on quality education of different institutions and bodies, on external and internal evaluation.

The Code of Education of the Republic of Belarus dated 13.01.2011 № 243 Adopted by Chamber of Representatives on 02.12.2010, approved by the Council of Republic on 22.12.2010 (article 124, article 125).

About adopting the Statute of Secondary Education Institution: Decree of Ministry of Education of the Republic of Belarus dated 20.12.2011 №283 // National Register of Legal Acts of the Republic of Belarus, 2012, № 42, 8/25102 (published on 11.04.2012)

About licensing separate types of activities // Order of President of the Republic of Belarus dated 01.09.2010 № 450

About some issues of quality control in education: Decree of Ministry of Education of the Republic of Belarus dated 29.12.2009 № 75

⁸ <http://www.arsimi.gov.al/newsroom/ligje>

⁹ <http://www.infocip.org/al/?p=6794>

¹⁰ <https://arsimi.gov.al/files/userfiles/.../dispozitat-normative.pdf>

About adopting the Instruction of organization of attestation activities in Belarusian educational institutions: Decree of Ministry of Education of the Republic of Belarus dated 22.01.2010 № 17 (paragraph 2 «Attestation is organized for assessment of activities of educational institutions in its compliance with requirements of legal acts of the Republic of Belarus including compliance of content, level and quality of training its graduates with requirements of educational standards»).

State Programme «Education and the youth policy» adopted for 2016 – 2020, approved by Decree of the Council of Ministers of the Republic of Belarus dated 28.03.2016 № 250.

About adopting educational standards of pre-school education // Decree of the Ministry of Education of the Republic of Belarus dated 29.12.2012 № 146

Educational standards of subjects ratified by Decree of Ministry of Education.

Belgium

Flemish Community

Core legislation on quality in education of the Flemish Community is composed by the following official documents.

Decree of 1 December 1993 concerning the inspection and guidance of philosophy-of-life courses.

Decision of the Flemish Government of 15 December 1993 implementing the Decree of 1 December 1993 concerning the inspection and guidance of philosophy-of-life courses.

Decree of 8 May 2009 concerning the quality of education.

Decision of the Flemish government of 24 April 2009 establishing the internal autonomous agency 'Agency for Quality Assurance in Education and Training'.

Flemish government decree of 01/10/2010 implementing the decree of 8 May 2009 on the quality of education with regard to the way in which some of the inspectorate's powers are executed (B.S. 26/11/2010).

Flemish government decree of 01/10/2010 implementing the decree of 8 May 2009 on the quality of education with regard to the reference framework for the inspectorate (BS13/01/2011).

French Community

Quality evaluation schemes have been the subject of legislative measures in recent years that have reinforced their role by defining their missions and specifying some of the ways in which they work. The starting-point for this development was the adoption of the *Decree on the Missions of Schools* (24 July 1997). This defines the goals that all pupils in compulsory education are supposed to attain, makes provision for the preparation of skills guidelines and creates an initial steering scheme. In 2002, the education system's steering mechanism was reinforced (*decree of 27 March 2002*). The aim of this mechanism is to increase the coherence of education in the French Community and improve the quality of the education system, in particular by the establishment of a Steering Committee. In 2007, the inspection system was completely reformed (*decree of 8 March 2007*). Thus three main schemes are employed at different levels of the system, from the micro-systemic (pupils) to the macro-systemic (the whole of the education system).

German Community

The quality of schools and the education system is referred to in the so-called foundational *decree of 31 August 1998* in Chapter VII (Evaluation and supervision of the school). The legal basis is the *decree of 25 June 2012* on school inspections and school development advice.

Lithuania

To ensure the quality of education in Lithuania, a significant progress was made in the field of regulation: a human right to qualitative education is guaranteed by law, the meaning of the concept of education quality has been introduced and general quality policy principles have been established. The concept of the quality of education is enshrined in the *Law on Education of the Republic of Lithuania (2011)*. This law contains a provision that “a learner has the right to receive a high-quality education”, whereas “the State ensures the quality of formal and to a certain extent, that of non-formal education”.

According to the *Law on Education (2011)*, the concept of the quality of education is created by the society, education participants and education management bodies. Education management bodies initiate and organize public debate about education purposes, objectives, methods of achieving them and their principles, provide for debate the evidence based on research and analysis, validate agreements within their competence and make strategic decisions.

The Concept of the quality assurance system of formal education (2008) provides a conceptual framework for political and social arrangements regarding the understanding of education quality and methods for quality assurance in formal education, as well as to create preconditions for harmonisation of the quality assurance policy in education.

Poland

Legislation framework with regards to quality in pre university education is presented in the following documents.

School Education Act of 7 September 1991 (as subsequently amended) regulates key aspects of school education; it outlines general rules for pedagogical supervision over schools, with detailed arrangements laid down in the Regulation of the Minister of National Education of 27 August 2015 on pedagogical supervision.

Act of 26 January 1982, The Teachers' Charter (as subsequently amended), regulates all key matters concerning teachers in the school education system, and outlines a general framework for the assessment of teachers' performance and professional achievements.

Regulation of the Minister of National Education of 6 August 2015 on the requirements for schools and other educational institutions lays down requirements which provide the basis for quality evaluation of schools and other institutions.

Regulation of the Minister of National Education of 27 August 2015 on pedagogical supervision lays down detailed rules for, and specifies elements of, pedagogical supervision, including evaluation, legal compliance auditing and support for nursery schools, schools and other institutions, and conditions for access to the digital platform for pedagogical supervision.

Regulation of the Minister of National Education of 21 December 2012 on the criteria and procedure for the assessment of teacher performance, appeals procedures, the composition and procedure for the establishment of an evaluation board (as subsequently amended): it lays down detailed rules for teacher performance assessment outlined in the Teachers' Charter.

Regulation of the Minister of National Education of 1 March 2013 on the professional promotion grades for teachers lays down the rules for the promotion of teachers, including the assessment of teachers' professional achievements.

Regulation of the Minister of National Education of 25 June 2015 on the detailed arrangements for conducting the primary school test, lower-secondary school examination and final upper-secondary school examinations lays down the rules for external examinations.

Russia

The system of education of the Russian Federation is regulated by the *Federal Law "On Education in the Russian Federation" No. 273-FZ that was adopted on 29 December 2012 and entered into force on 1 September 2013*. The Russian Federation has supported the concern in quality education through the law. The Federal Law of the Russian Federation "On Education in the Russian Federation" contains this definition: "education quality – complex characteristic of educational activity and of student preparation, which reflects their degree of conformity to state standards, state requirements as well as (or) the needs of natural persons or legal entities, in the interest of whom the educational activities is conducted, including the degree of achievement of the educational program results" (article 2, paragraph 29). Article 91 contains rules on licensing of educational activities. Article 92 stipulates rules on accreditation of educational activities. The article 95 contains the description of the rules and legal procedures of the quality assurance and assessment in educational organization.

Legal regulation of a broad variety of vital rights and responsibilities of students and teachers is given in the mentioned law. Details are delegated to sub-legal normative acts, or to regional, municipal or even local legislative level.

3.2. Quality of inputs

Education inputs are resources and means which need to be provided in an education system to achieve education objectives, such as: teachers, school building, classroom, equipment, school furniture, curricula and textbooks, and the cost and level of financial resources used for education.

3.2.1. Quality of school environment

A rights-based, child-friendly school requires a healthy, hygienic and safe learning environment, with adequate water and sanitation facilities and healthy classrooms.¹¹ Overall norms for the construction and modernization of school buildings are also relevant in this regard. Specific norms are required for infrastructure for technical and vocational education. Class size and pupil-teacher ratio is another important indicator of quality of education.¹² How the national legislations support the implementation of the input quality? All countries have rules presented in bylaw documents related to school environment, but they use different norms.

Albania

There are some bylaw documents that contain requirements on school environment. Two of them are "*Guidelines for designing the building. Norms and standards*", issued by the Ministry of Education, Sport and Youth in 2015 and the "*Instruction nr.44, dated 16.10.2014 On norms of teaching and number of students per classroom in the institutions of the pre university education*" of the Minister of Education Sport and Youth. The Guide is intended to serve as a reference for all those involved in the planning, programming, design and construction of new school buildings/spaces or in the rehabilitation of existing school buildings. Instruction of the minister of education specifies the number of pupils per classroom according to the level of the education and location of the school (urban, rural area), compulsory and optional subjects, general and professional schools.

¹¹ See UNICEF Life skills page, available at http://www.unicef.org/lifeskills/index_7260.html.

¹² Joint ILO/UNESCO Committee of Experts on the Application of the Recommendations concerning Teaching Personnel (CEART), Report of the Tenth session held in Paris, 28 September – 2 October 2009.

Ministry of Education, Sports and Youth has recommended that all new classrooms will have a capacity of (i) 30 to 36 of the students' places in areas with high density populations (mainly urban ones), (ii) 24 of students in areas with low density populations (mainly rural areas), and (iv) practical work in laboratories and specialized halls will be taught in half-sized groups of 15-18 or 12 students.

The average areas of the study rooms range from 44 to 48 m² for schools in areas with a low density population with a class of 26 students and from 58 to 65 m² in areas with high density population with a class of 30- 36 students.

Belarus

In the Republic of Belarus section «the rules for the quality of environment, standards for the schools, for the class size, for the ratio teacher-student» is regulated by the following legal acts «*Sanitary norms and regulations*», «*Requirements for secondary education institutions*»: chapter 1, paragraphs 14-25, chapter 2, paragraphs 30-50, chapter 3, paragraphs 52-60, chapter 5, paragraphs 68-75, chapter 6, paragraphs 76-97, chapter 7, paragraphs 98-111, chapter 8, paragraphs 133-148, as well as by Part III «Educational relations», Part V «Disciplinary responsibility of pupils», Part VIII «Organization of study process in implementation of general secondary education study programs», Chapter 24. «Organization of study process in implementation of general secondary education study programs».

The legal documents contain requirements to building and classrooms of educational institution. Design capacity of an educational institution must provide organization of pupils' study process in one shift. In the process of designing and constructing of educational institutions such fact that walking distance of educational institutions should be no more than 0,5 km in cities and in countryside – 2-3 km should be taken into consideration.

Paragraph 36 of the chapter “Requirements to building and classrooms of educational institution” states that classroom space must be no less than 2 square meters per one pupil. While constructing buildings of educational institutions this space must be no less than 2,2 square meters per one pupil (part 3 of paragraph 36 by decisions of Ministry of Health dated 29.07.2014 № 63, 17.05.2017 № 35).

Paragraph 101 of Chapter 7 «Requirements to organization of study process» states that a maximum number of pupils per class in educational institutions is determined by the Code of Education of the Republic of Belarus and with area norms in classrooms per one pupil (in accordance with paragraphs 33 and 35 of present Sanitary norms and regulations (paragraph 101 by decisions of Ministry of Health dated 29.07.2014 № 63).

Belgium

AGION, the agency that subsidises Flemish school buildings, has formulated some basic principles for quality school buildings in Flanders and set them out in strategic policy objectives. Contemporary school buildings should, first of all, be functional and sustainable. They should be safe, comfortable, easy to maintain and easily accessible. They should support the school's pedagogical project, provide a stimulating learning environment and be suitable for flexible and multifunctional use. A school building monitoring system was designed to check the extent to which schools in Flanders meet these standards and their corresponding policy objectives.

Lithuania

Since 2005, the Education Law transfer responsibilities on quality of school environment to municipalities.

Poland

In Poland the quality of school environment is, inter alia, understood as providing students with safe conditions at school which is provided by a number of regulations requiring school staff to comply with the health and safety rules. Ensuring safe conditions for students' stay at school is, first and foremost, a duty of the school's principal as well as teachers.

Polish law also determines the number of students in a primary school class in grades 1-3 providing that it may not be greater than 25. It was also provided that in a public school there must be no more than 20 students, including no more than 5 students with disabilities. The basic regulation on the student-teacher relations in Polish law is provided in Art. 6 of the Act of 26 January 1982 – *Teacher's Charter*.

Russia

There are several types of documents that regulate this issue in the Russian Federation. First, there are Federal state educational standards. Each level of general education has its own standard, and in professional education there are a lot of standards for each profession, specialization. They set requirements for the conditions of implementation of educational programs. For example, they include requirements to material and technical conditions. Such requirements describe the architectural accessibility of buildings (for persons with disabilities) and premises that should be in the building - language laboratories, sports facilities, medical rooms, libraries, catering facilities. Standards define the technical equipment, consumables, and requirements to the territory of the organization and so on.

In addition to educational standards, there are sanitary standards for different levels of education. The requirements for the safety of premises are defined, for example, lighting, ventilation, temperature, allowed types of buildings projects, as well as requirements for the safe organization of the educational process, for example, the frequency and duration of breaks. Fire safety standards, building codes and regulations are established. There are requirements to equipment of educational places and places of personal hygiene, catering facilities, and so on. In addition, the regulations set special conditions for education of persons with disabilities, which also include specific requirements to material and technical conditions for training such persons. Thus, in the Russian Federation there are a lot of detailed requirements to the school environment which aim to ensure the safety and quality of education.

3.2.2. Quality of curricula

Laws and policies in Albania, Belarus, Poland and Russia require the national curriculum to establish common core competencies with uniform standards countrywide. Ministries of education and other national education authorities in these countries frame the national curriculum according to curriculum standards. Belgium uses school-based curriculum approach. In Lithuania the core curriculum is set at a national level but leaves room for local variation.

Albania

The Law no.69/2012, amended, "On Pre-University Education System in the Republic of Albania" contains rules about school curriculum. Article 44 stipulated that the curriculum shall be developed as a whole for the entire educational levels with regard to the creation of values, skills and main concepts, as well as teaching, learning principles and evaluation of students. Article 45 indicates that curriculum shall consist of the core curriculum, choice curriculum and curriculum for complementary activities. Article 46 asks the private educational institution to get approval of the minister of education for the curriculum at the

licensing moment and for each amendment. Article 47 states that textbooks shall be selected by the teachers on school basis, following the certification by the ministry.

Belarus

Educational process in educational institutions is organized in accordance with conceptual [2; 10], legal [1; 5; 6; 7; 8; 9] and academic support [3; 11; 12]. Curricula are developed on the basis of strategies of social and economic development of country [1; 9], science and technologies, concepts of school subjects [2] and educational standards of school subjects [3]. Principle authorities responsible for quality of school curricula and textbooks, revision of implementation by schools targeted indicators of pupils' success in study programs are: Ministry of Education of the Republic of Belarus, scientific methodological institution «National institute of education», regional and district educational departments, regional institutes of development of education. There are structures implementing monitoring of quality of school education in each of this institutional body.

Belgium

In Belgium the school-based curricula are in use. According to the 2009 Decree on Quality of Education, each school is responsible for providing good quality education. Within the framework of attainment targets and developmental objectives, schools are free to develop their own curricula, which will reflect different priorities and cover broader areas. In practice, most schools work within the curricula developed by the umbrella organisations of their educational network.

Lithuania

The education system is reasonably decentralised. National institutions, municipalities and education institutions share the responsibility for quality of education provided. The core curriculum is set at a national level but leaves room for local variation.

Poland

The Ministry of Education establishes core curriculum requirements, allowing a high degree of autonomy for schools and teachers. The current core curriculum introduces a number of didactical methods focused on solving problems, critical thinking and creativity, in preparation for the upper-secondary exit examination.

Russia

There are two types of officially prescribed documents: standards and curriculum programs. Standards are employed to control and regulate general educational aims and ideas, teaching priorities, and a list of school subjects. Curriculum programs cover specific school disciplines and include at least three components: (a) aims, (b) content, and (c) suggested pupils' activities.

*Federal State Educational Standard*¹³ is a set of the obligatory requirements for implementation of the main educational programs at school. These are set requirements for the basic educational programs implementation of primary general, basic general, secondary

¹³ Federal State Educational Standard for the Basic General Education (approved by the order No 1897 of the Ministry for Education and Science of Russia issued 17 December 2010)

Federal State Educational Standard for the Primary General Education (approved by the order No 1897 of the Ministry for Education and Science of Russia issued 6 October 2009 № 373; as revised 26 November 2010 № 1241, and 22 September 2011 № 2357)

Federal State Educational Standard for Secondary (Complete) General Education (approved by the order No 413 of the Ministry for Education and Science of Russia issued 17 April 2012 № 413)

general, primary professional, secondary professional education compulsory for implementing by educational institutions with state accreditation.

Local development of curricula and materials became legal in 1992. The quality and content of curricula vary greatly among public schools. A major factor encouraging local initiative is the disarray of federal education agencies, which often leave oblast, regional, and municipal authorities to their own devices.

3.2.3. Quality of teachers

The quality of teachers is an important determining factor for the quality of education. The quality of education is heavily dependent on the qualifications and motivation of teachers. Hence, the adoption of a normative framework for the teaching profession is also extremely important. Enhancing career development perspectives for teachers is crucial. In this regard, the UNESCO-ILO Recommendation concerning the Status of Teachers (1966) provides a basis for developing national laws applicable to all teachers, in both private and public schools.

States usually have standards that lay down the minimum qualification or experience required to enter the profession. Minimum eligibility in terms of qualifications for the teaching profession includes at least a university degree, and it should be obligatory for state authorities to deploy only qualified and trained teachers in schools.

In-service training for teachers is a permanent requirement, not only to cover gaps in their qualification, but also to ensure their capacities are adapted to new demands.

Albania

As teachers play a vital role in the improvement of the quality of education, the Albania

Government has taken the reform on teaching profession. In the last decade (2007-2017), the Parliament and Government of Albania have approved a number of laws and bylaw documents that have impacted the development of teaching profession and teacher's status.

In 2010, the Albanian Government included teaching profession in the list of the regulated professions. (*Law N0.10171, date 22.10.2009 "On regulated professions in Republic of Albania", changed by Law N0.10357, date 16.1.2010; Law N0.10470, date 13.10.2011; Law N0.90/2015, date 17.07.2014.*) The Law No.69/2012 "On pre-university education system in Republic of Albania" contains three articles (article 57, 58, 59) that determine requirements for teachers' diplomas, continuous professional training, and qualifications of teachers.

The packet of the professional development of teachers contains *Professional standards of the general and subject training of the elementary education teachers* and *Professional standards of the general and subject training of the lower and upper education teachers* (2016). These are regulatory documents that assist educators in guiding their own professional learning; districts and schools with creating and implementing their professional development plans and programs; assist individual teachers and principals in assessing teacher's performance.

Belarus

Professional qualification standard of a teacher is a legal act setting requirements to content of teachers' activity and qualification essential for teachers' activities. It reflects legal basis of the following functions of a teacher: organization of learning and upbringing process; creation of developing learning environment; provision of legal and methodological support of learning process; implementation of scientific research and innovation activity;

organization of social interaction aiming at achievement of educational targets; stimulate personal and professional development [7; 8].

In general, all forms of teachers' evaluation are carried out in educational institutions on the basis of special educational legal support. Proficiency testing of teachers for the highest and «teacher-methodologist» categories is carried out by state commission which deals with further training of teachers [1; 3; 4; 5; 6; 9].¹⁴

Belgium

Teaching in Flemish Community schools requires the following minimum qualifications (Flemish Ministry of Education and Training, 2015). Teachers at the pre-primary, primary and lower secondary education level, as well as teachers of certain programmes in upper secondary education, are required to have a bachelor's degree in teacher education for the relevant level. Teachers in the general upper secondary education need to complete a master's degree (in a given discipline) and a specific teacher education certificate. For teachers of practical subjects in technical and vocational education, a combination of a general qualification (secondary degree, bachelor's degree) with a specific teacher education certificate is also possible.

In the Flemish Community, individual teachers are evaluated within schools using an individual job description as a reference. Individual teachers need to undergo a formal evaluation at least once every four years.

Lithuania

In 2015 are taken measures to improve the competencies and qualifications of teaching staff. A new set of requirements for initial teacher education were included in the *Descriptor of the Study Field of Education and Training*. The requirements are compulsory for all teacher training institutions in higher education from 2017.

Poland

The *Teachers' Charter*, changed in 2016 is the document that contains rules about the quality of teachers. In accordance with the Teachers' Charter, teachers are expected to continuously improve their professional qualifications. Teacher assessment is based on the framework established at school level. School principals are responsible for teacher appraisal. Systematic assessment and appraisal of teachers contribute to the design of teachers' professional development.

¹⁴ The Code of Education of the Republic of Belarus: 13.01.2011 № 243-3 : adopted by Chamber of representatives on 02.12.2010: approved by the Council of Republic on 22.12.2010 – Minsk: Republic Institute of High School, 2011. – 352 p.

- Order of Ministry of Education of the Republic of Belarus dated 11.05.2017 № 46 «About introducing amendments and supplements to Order of Ministry of Education of the Republic of Belarus dated 22.08.2012 № 101».
- Order of Ministry of Education of the Republic of Belarus dated 22.08.2012 № 101 «About adopting Regulations on attestation of teachers (except for academicians)» (amended by decisions of the Ministry of Education dated 26.03.2014 № 20, 26.11.2014 № 163, 20.11.2015 № 131)
- Decision of Ministry of Education of the Republic of Belarus dated 24.04.2013 № 22 «About typical workforce and regulations of staff members number in separate institutions of general and special education».
- Programme of development of secondary education in 2007–2016 approved by Decision of the Council of Ministers of the Republic of Belarus dated 31.05.2007 № 725.
- Professional qualification standard of a teacher (project) [e-resource]. – Regime of access: <http://elib.bspu.by/handle/doc/14173> – Date of access: 09.01.2018.

Russia

I. Federal law N 273-FL as of 29.12.2012 (amendment as of 29.12.2017 and 19.02.2018) "On the Education in Russian Federation stipulate rules on teacher quality. According to the Article 46, to perform teaching activities one should have secondary vocational or higher education and meet the qualification requirements specified in the qualification guides and (or) professional standards. Article 48 specifies the duties and responsibilities of teachers and contains a set of requirements. Article 49 contains information on certification of teachers. Certification of teachers is carried out in order to confirm their adequacy for the job and is based on evaluation of their professional work. Certification is made once in five years. The evaluation is made by special certification board formed by educational organization. In the Russian Federation there is also a certification for assignment of qualification category. It is voluntary for teachers, but it plays an important role in the qualification of teachers. Two types of certification, actually

Professional Standards is the document that contains the list of professional and personal requirements to teachers that is valid in Russian Federation. Teacher standard (pedagogical activities in preschool, primary, basic, secondary general education) (educator, teacher) was approved by Decree of the Ministry of Labour of Russia No. 544n as of October 18, 2013. Professional standard of teachers is widely applied as a tool to raise and improve quality of education, as a tool to measure the qualification of teacher.

3.3. Quality of results

3.3.1. Evaluation of learning achievements

The assessment of students' performance and achievements provides an important indicator of the quality of education. According to the analyses of six countries legislation it is noted that, most governments have focused on measuring academic knowledge (languages, math, and sciences), literacy and numeracy through regular state examinations and international assessments. National learning assessments may include monitoring of subject-specific achievements; standards-based assessments according to grade or age; school-based assessments of pupil progress, based on tests or performance; and external public examinations at major system transition points, such as from primary to secondary education or end of secondary education. International assessments of students' achievements or basic skills are also used.

Albania

The legislation (*The Law No.69/2012 "On pre-university education system in Republic of Albania, article 48, 49, 50, 51 and a number of instructions of the minister of education*) stipulates the rules on assessing students' achievement. The law sets the aim, criteria and ways of assessment; on national exams (exam of the initial education and school leaving state exam); on national assessment that assess achievements of students of 3rd grade in subjects: Albanian Language, mathematics, sciences, and 5th grade in subjects: Albanian language, mathematics, sciences, civic education; and international tests through participation of Albania in PISA and other international assessments programs. *Normative provisions (2013)*, a bylaw document presents detail rules on student assessment according to the level of education and type of school, on repeating the class, on tasks of schools and local education organisms for monitoring student achievement; and rules on use of the quality fund given by the state. The Agency of Education Services is the national body responsible for the external student assessment.

Belarus

Currently issues of attestation and assessment of pupils' knowledge are regulated by the Code of Education of the Republic of Belarus «About education» (hereinafter referred to as Code dated 13.01.2011 (amended on 18.07.2016) [1], as well as by Order of Ministry of Education of the Republic of Belarus dated 29.05.2009 № 674 «About setting principles of assessment of results of educational activities and assessment criteria of pupils' behaviour in secondary schools» [2].

Belgium

The quality of education is analysed on the basis of the pupils' results in various external tests: the certificate of primary education (CEB), various external certificate examinations, which are common to all schools and are currently under development with respect to the certificates and diplomas associated with secondary education, and external non-certificate assessments.

Participation in various international assessments provides yet another perspective on what pupils learn: for example, PISA, PIRLS and ESLC.

In addition to these external assessments, internal appraisals take place within classes. At this level, the assessment of pupils falls within the competence of various bodies: some such assessments are specific to the school itself or to the controlling authority (which, subject to compliance with the laws and decrees, may define the methods and frequency of these assessments, the grading system, etc.); other pupil assessments are arranged by individual teachers; others again are the responsibility of the central services.

Lithuania

Quality of student results as the element of external quality assurance is the responsibility of Central Examination Board. It is subject to separate detailed regulations.

Poland

Student assessment is composed of assessments by teachers and central examinations. System evaluation uses national assessments of learning outcomes and international student assessments to monitor performance of the education system. Poland also monitors student performance through large-scale international studies such as PISA, TIMSS and PIRLS. In addition, the Educational Research Institute analyses the functioning and effectiveness of the education system.

The external pupil/student assessment system, which covers only school education, is related to quality assurance insofar as external examination results measure the performance of schools in an objective way, and analysis of these results should contribute to improving the quality of education. Moreover, analysis of external examination results is one of the requirements in external evaluation of schools. The system comprises a set of standardized external tests/exams. Detailed reports with exam results are published by each Regional Examination Board at regional level and by the Central Examination Board at national level. Exam results are used both in quality improvement activities by the Heads of the REAs as part of pedagogical supervision at regional level, and in policy development by the national education authorities.

Russia

Federal law N 273-FL as of 29.12.2012 (amendment as of 29.12.2017) "On the Education in Russian Federation Article 95.1. Independent assessment of training quality of students sets rules about student achievements.

-
1. An independent assessment of the quality of the training of students is conducted on the initiative of the participants in the field of education in order to prepare information on the level of students' learning of the educational program or its parts, to provide information to the participants in the field of education about the quality of the training of students.
 2. Organizations that carry out an independent assessment of the quality of the training of students determine the types of education, groups of trainees and / or educational programs or their parts for which an independent assessment of the quality of training of students is conducted, as well as the conditions, forms and methods for conducting an independent assessment of the quality of training for students.
 3. An independent assessment of the quality of training of students is also carried out within the framework of international comparative studies in the field of education in accordance with the criteria and requirements of Russian, foreign and international organizations.

CHAPTER IV: EVALUATION OF QUALITY IN PRE UNIVERSITY EDUCATION

4.1. External evaluation of schools

External school evaluation, already widely used in the early 2000s as an approach to quality assurance (Eurydice, 2004).

In 2007 and 2009 respectively, the French and German-speaking Communities of Belgium have broadened the focus of their evaluation systems, previously focused on individual teachers. In Flemish Community the Inspectorate is responsible for external evaluation. In Poland, external school evaluation is carried out by regional superintendents' offices (regional inspectorates). They implement the policy of the Ministry of Education but are responsible to the governor of the province who represents the Prime Minister in the regions. In Albania, Belarus, Lithuania, Poland, Russia the responsibilities for external evaluation are shared between the central and local levels.

In Albania, Belarus, Lithuania, Poland and Russia where external evaluation of schools is implemented, structured and standardised frameworks are in use establishing the content and expectations of external evaluations. In those countries, all external evaluators have to use the same framework(s). Typically, the frameworks for external evaluation designed centrally cover a broad range of school aspects, including the quality of teaching and learning, student learning outcomes, various areas of school management, as well as compliance with regulations.

Countries establish the frequency of external school evaluation according to three main models: 1) a cyclical model in which all schools are evaluated at regular intervals specified by central/top level authorities or by the inspectorate; 2) a focused approach based on sampling, risk assessment, or ad hoc criteria established at central/top level authority and through an annual or multiannual work programme; 3) a combination of the two.

In the case of the cyclical model, evaluations take place at regular intervals which can range from two years to a maximum of 10-years.

Albania

The external evaluation is supported by the law. According to the *Law No.69/2012 "On pre-university education system in Republic of Albania, article 6/11, 25/c*, the educational service shall rely and be evaluated based on the standards and indicators.

The State Inspectorate of Education is the institution under the authority of the minister of education, responsible for the external evaluation of the educational institutions. The main functions of the inspectorate for pre-university education are: a) evaluating the quality of the service of educational institutions and local educational units; b) checking out the compliance of the activity of the educational institutions and local educational units with the effective legal requirements; c) advising the educational managers and employees of educational institutions and of local educational units; ç) informing the Minister, local educational units and institutions for findings of educational inspections, as well as making them public; d) dissemination of successful practices of educational institutions and local educational units.

The State Inspectorate of Education examines the performance of the schools on the basis of a Guide that defines all aspects of the quality of teaching and administration and school management. Evaluation of school and school organisms is made based on the scale with four descriptions "very good," "good," "sufficient", and "poor".

The Heads of Local Education Units evaluate every two years the performance of school principal according to a set of indicators.

Belarus

In accordance with the Code of Education of the Republic of Belarus, control of quality in education is determined as activities of authorized state bodies aiming at checking compliance of education with educational standard, compliance of study documentation of educational programs, educational activities with legal requirements [1]. Special governmental and local authorities are responsible for control of quality in education. *Department of Quality Control of Ministry of Education of the Republic of Belarus*) is a structural sector of Ministry of Education of the Republic of Belarus possessing rights of a legal entity and state authorities which control quality in education executing of control of quality in education; development of legal acts in the sphere of quality control in education; consideration and application of progressive forms of international experience in enhancing quality control methods in education. [2].

Departments of Education of Regional Executive Committees execute correspondent control at a regional level; while *Departments of Education, Sport and Tourism* execute control at level of district executive committees. There are inspectors in each department of education which control educational institutions and give practical assistance in its functioning.

«*National Institute of Education*» of *Ministry of Education of the Republic of Belarus* implements organizational and methodological support of republican monitoring.

Belgium

The Flemish Community. External evaluation of schools is implemented by the Flemish Inspectorate of Education. *The Flemish Community's Educational Inspectorate* works on behalf of the Flemish government and is responsible for overseeing the quality of education. External inspection by the Inspectorate ensures that schools implement the centrally-set attainment targets and developmental objectives, comply with the regulations for recognition and financing and systematically monitor their own quality.

Since 2009, the Inspectorate pursues a differentiated approach where every school has to be inspected at least once every ten years, but some schools will receive more frequent and intensive inspection, depending on the Inspectorate's evaluation of their educational quality.

On average, the Inspectorate visits schools after an interval of five years (Flemish Ministry of Education and Training, 2015a). The Inspectorate uses an inspection framework with quality indicators to evaluate school context, input, processes and output. Following the inspection process, the Inspectorate prepares a report for publication, which contains a recommendation to the Flemish government about the schools' quality and future steps to be taken.

Agency for Quality Assurance in Education and Training (AKOV) which was set up in 2009 has as a mission to create a quality assurance system for educational and vocational programmes and training pathways and for the EVC pathways leading to recognised qualifications

French Community. At the level of pre-secondary and secondary education, quality evaluation must be situated in the general context of the Belgian education system, which guarantees a significant degree of freedom to the networks in the management of schools and the definition of curricula and educational methods.

The Education System Steering Committee is a consultative body which aims to respond to the need to evaluate the functioning of the education system and to identify approaches to improving the quality of education. *The General Department of Inspection* also plays an important role in the steering of the education system. Other boards and advisory bodies also contribute to the steering of the education system: for example, a permanent mission to evaluate integration actions was entrusted to the *General Consultation Board for Specialised Education* by the decree of 5 February 2009. The bodies in charge of carrying out external school evaluation determine annually, or on a multiannual basis, the criteria against which they select schools to be visited.

German Community. The government designates an institution that is responsible for the external evaluation of schools. The objectives of the external evaluation are: to provide the government, the school authority and the *Department of Education at the Ministry* in the GC with a complete report about the strengths and weaknesses based on individual school reports, performed every three years. The findings and results are confidential. Since January 2009, the external evaluation is compulsory. Every school is externally evaluated once every five years.

Lithuania

The Law on Education specifies that the purpose of education supervision is to monitor the availability and quality of education and promote educational development, provide guidance and evaluate performance. Education supervision comprises monitoring of access to education and its quality, provision of guidance to education providers, assistance agencies and education management entities, implementation of preventive measures, external evaluation, application of sanctions, promotion of measures for enhancing education improvement and other statutory instruments.

The Ministry of Education and Science is charged with the task of performing state supervision of education providers' activities. Supervision of schools is performed by institutions implementing the rights and obligations of the owners (budgetary institutions in case of state schools), municipal executive institutions (budgetary institutions in case of municipal schools), institutions (meetings of participants) implementing the rights and obligations of the owners (public self-governing institutions in case of state and municipal schools) and the owners (meetings of participants) (in case of all other schools), with the help of external evaluators, if necessary. The current model of external school evaluation is based on all schools being evaluated on a seven-year cycle with the goal of promoting good quality self-evaluation in schools.

National Agency for School Evaluation mission is to assist the Ministry of Education and Science to ensure the quality of education, the development of educational institutions in self-assessment and evaluation, and enabling school leaders and founders to improve the quality solutions, using the available data.

Poland

The evaluation and assessment framework in Poland is defined by the Ministry of National Education and implemented by a regional system and by schools themselves. The quality of a school is assessed according to an established set of standards. External quality assurance is based primarily on the pedagogical supervision system, which includes three elements: evaluation; legal compliance auditing; support to improve performance.

The key actors responsible for external evaluation are: 1) the *Minister of National Education* (the minister responsible for school education), the ministers responsible for culture and national heritage, agriculture and environment as well as the Minister of Justice who supervise specific types of schools; 2) the *Heads of the Regional Education Authorities*.

Pursuant to the legislation external evaluation is conducted on a regular (scheduled) and ad hoc basis. The legislation does not define the frequency of external evaluation. Scheduled evaluations are carried out in line with the aims of the national policy and a pedagogical supervision plan in which the Minister of National Education defines the scope of evaluations for every school year. Within the framework set by the Minister, the Heads of the Regional Education Authorities (REAs) develop more detailed plans for supervision in their provinces. Criteria for the choice of schools to be covered by evaluation are determined by the Heads of the REAs. The procedure for external evaluation is defined in the legislation only in general terms.

Russia

The article 95 of the *Federal Law "On Education in the Russian Federation"* contains the description of the rules and legal procedures of the quality assurance and assessment in educational organization.

Independent assessment of the quality of education is carried out by legal entities performing specific types of such assessment. In order to create conditions for an independent assessment of the quality of educational activities of organizations: 1) the *federal executive body*, which carries out the functions of elaborating state policy and normative and legal regulation in the sphere of education, with the participation of public organizations, forms a public council for conducting an independent quality assessment educational activities of organizations and approves regulations on it; 2) *executive bodies* of the constituent entities of the Russian Federation that carry out public administration in the sphere of education, with the participation of public organizations, form public councils for conducting an independent assessment of the quality of educational activities of organizations located in the territories of constituent entities of the Russian Federation, and approve regulations on them; 3) *bodies of local self-government* with the participation of public organizations have the right to form public councils for conducting an independent assessment of the quality of educational activity of organizations located in the territories of municipal entities and to approve regulations on them.

The indicators characterizing the general criteria for assessing the quality of educational activities of organizations are established by the federal executive body, which exercises functions on the development of state policy and normative and legal regulation in the sphere of education, with preliminary discussion at the public council.

An independent assessment of the quality of educational activities of organizations, organized by public councils for its conduct, is conducted no more than once a year and at least every three years.

Organizations that carry out an independent evaluation of the quality of education place information on the procedure and results of an independent evaluation of the quality of education in the Internet and send it to the Federal Government bodies, education and local government.

Based on the results of an independent evaluation of the quality of education, the ratings of organizations that carry out educational activities and (or) the educational programs that they implement can be formed.

4. 2. Internal evaluation of schools

During the last decade, many countries have tended to apply internal evaluation. Internal evaluation can provide schools with means to improve the quality and make them more effective.

Central/top level regulations currently establish that internal evaluation is compulsory in all six of the analysed education systems. In Albania and Russia internal evaluation is carried out based on the national instructions and indicators. In Poland the legislation does not stipulates the procedures for internal, while mentions the use of observation as a tool.

In Belarus, Belgium (Flemish Community) schools has more freedom to conduct internal evaluation, but they must take in account the policy context defined by the government, while in French Community the school head is representative of the controlling authority.

In Albania, Belgium (French Community), Poland, Russia supervision plan is prepared every school year by the school, while in Belgium (German Community) internal evaluation is conducted every three years.

Albania

Legal rules on internal school evaluation are expressed in these legal documents “*Law no. 69/2012, dated 21.06.2012, "On the pre-university education system in the Republic of Albania"*, as amended; “*Normative provisions on pre university education*”; “*Card of school performance*” and in the “*Manual on inspection and internal evaluation of school*”.

Internal school evaluation aims to improve the quality of its service through analysis and reflection on achievements and opportunities for improvement. Internal evaluation analyses strengths, weakness, opportunities for improvement, factors that have impacted quality.

Schools carry out internal evaluation using the same areas, indicators, instruments and standards that are used for the purposes of the external evaluation and are published in the official inspection manual.

Internal evaluation is carried out every year and within four school years covers all areas foreseen by the official inspection manual. Internal evaluation is carried out at any period of the school year. The duration of the internal evaluation is determined by the school directorate after consultation with the council of teachers.

Belarus

Article 124 of the Code of Education of the Republic of Belarus provides educational institutions with possibility to organize self-control activities aiming at quality assurance in

education. Terms of organization of self-control activities are regulated by head of educational institution.

Head of educational institution is responsible for quality control in education in accordance with three stated aspects: a) quality of terms (attestation of teachers for awarding qualification category which must be held at least once in 5 years; control of everyday update of curricula, educational and methodological materials); b) quality of process (attendance of «open lessons», organization of methodological seminars, summary of leading experience); c) quality of result (results of tests, graduate exams, number of university applicants, visit of schools by graduates). Aiming at quality control and self-evaluation of educational process, head of educational institution has a right to make decisions concerning organization of self-control.

Belgium

Flemish Community. The Decree concerning equal educational opportunities I (GOK-I) (B.S. 14/09/02) grants, for the first time, the status of statutory expectation to self-evaluations of schools. Elementary and secondary schools which can bank on GOK resources are expected to carry out a self-evaluation of the policy implemented during the lifetime of the Equal Educational.

Since the decree on the quality of education (B.S. 28/08/09), educational institutions and CPGs have had the task of conducting a qualitative policy independently. However, this independent policy must take account of the policy context defined by the government in the regulations. Moreover, every institution should systematically evaluate its own quality. The institution may decide for itself how to do this.

French Community. The head of institution has a general mission relating to the educational policy and organisation of the institution in which he or she works. He/she is the representative of the controlling authority in dealings with the Ministry of the French Community and the inspection services. The controlling authorities (in grant-aided education) or the head of institution (in education organised by the French Community) are required to formulate proposals on adapting the school plan which is defined in each school. They are also required to draw up an annual activity report and submit it for the appraisal of the institution's participation council.

German Community. The Pedagogical Council is responsible for the organisation of internal evaluation on the school level. The objectives of the internal evaluation are; 1) to check whether and to what extent school structures, methods and results of academic work complies with the objective of the school project; 2) to offer a scientific basis for the future development of the school.

The internal evaluation of the school is conducted at least every three years and can refer to academic individual subjects, which are determined by the Pedagogical Council or the school authority. The government checks to see whether this evaluation has taken place. The opinions of the parent and pupil representatives are requested during the internal evaluation.

Lithuania

The goal of self-evaluation is to forecast the prospects for school improvement. The school council selects the areas of activities for self-evaluation, the methodology for its performance, evaluation methods, forms and tools, and analyses the self-evaluation results as well as making decisions regarding the improvement of its performance.

Every year the National Agency requests schools to optionally provide reports on the use of self-evaluation results for performance improvement. Some 80 per cent of general education schools provide self-evaluation results and present their progress in terms of improving their performance.

Since 2013, all Lithuanian general education schools have been provided online access to the *internet platform IQES* targeting schools' self-evaluation and performance improvement. IQES enables three levels of self-evaluation and improvement: 1) for person (teacher); 2) for professional teams; 3) for school as organization. In this system, pupils, their parents and teachers are able to express their opinions on education quality in a particular school. IQES LT also provides schools with an online toolkit combining instruments for the assessment and self-evaluation of efforts taken by the school, its pupils, parents and teachers.

In 2016 new *Recommendations for Self-Evaluation of the Quality of Performance in General Education Schools* were approved. Under this document, self-evaluation of the quality of performance in general education schools is based on the selected methods, forms and instruments. Collection of data is aimed at finding answers to questions related to pupil progress and achievement, school activities and the quality of their individual aspects as well as the success of ongoing programmes or projects.

Poland

Internal evaluation is obligatorily carried out every school year. As provided for in the legislation, scheduled and ad hoc evaluations concern issues or topics which the school considers relevant to its activities. The scope and subject of internal evaluation is determined by the school head in consultation with other management staff. However, since internal evaluation is intended to be a team-based activity, these issues should be agreed with all teachers.

Internal evaluations are carried out on the basis of a pedagogical supervision plan, prepared by the school head for every school year and presented to the teaching council of the school. A supervision plan should include the objectives, extent and subject, as well as the schedule of internal evaluation.

The legislation does not lay down the procedure for internal evaluation. The only tool referred to in the legislation is observation: the school head observes classes conducted by teachers, as well as other activities undertaken in line with the school's statutory tasks. In practice, this means that observation may cover both classes and other activities such as teachers' meetings with parents.

Findings from internal evaluation in a given school year are presented by the school head to the school's teaching council in a report on all internal pedagogical supervision tasks carried out by the head. Results of internal evaluation are not published, but they are obligatorily used to improve school performance and are taken into consideration in external evaluation.

Russia

Federal Law of 29 December 2012 No 273-FZ (edited on 29 December 2017) "On Education in the Russian Federation", article 28/13 on "Competences, rights, duties, and responsibilities of the educational institution" states that the educational institution has the competency to carry out self-examination, providing functioning of the internal system of education quality evaluation.

The Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation confirmed two subordinate acts regulating self-assessment procedure: Order of 14 June 2013 No 462 "Concerning Approval of the Procedure of Self-assessment of the Educational Institution" and Order of 10 December 2013 No 1324 "Concerning Approval of the Performance

Indicators of the Educational Institution Subject to Self-assessment". The indicators are grouped according to the directions used for efficiency assessment of the activity of education authorities of the corresponding level with some changes. Thus, indicators for the activity of general educational institution subject to self-assessment are grouped in such directions as teaching and learning activity, students' achievements quality control, human resources of the educational institution, infrastructure.

Self-assessment is aimed at providing access and openness of information on the educational institution as well as preparing the report on self-assessment results. The institution carries out self-assessment every year. The institution determines self-assessment terms, procedure, and responsible people.

Self-assessment procedure is used to assess teaching and learning activity, management system of the institution, content and quality of students' preparation, organization of the educational process, need in graduates, quality of human resources, learning and teaching support material, library and information support, material and technical basis, functioning the internal system of education quality assessment, as well as the analysis of performance indicators for the institution subject to self-assessment set by the federal executive authority.

Self-assessment results are presented in the form of the report including analytical part and the results of the analysis of performance indicators for the institution subject to self-assessment.

CASES ON QUALITY IN EDUCATION

Albanian case: Violation of the standards for private education from the school "Flabina"

The private school "Flabina" was opened in 2000. It developed its activity by 2015. During May-July 2015, the State Education Inspectorate assessed the implementation of the recommendations and tasks left by the inspection team at the private school Flabina. During the inspection, it was found that the private educational institution "Flabina" had changed the location without obtaining the approval of the Ministry of Education and Sports and exercised unlicensed activities in the basic education cycle (9-year cycle).

Based on Law no. 69/2012, dated 21.06.2012, "On the pre-university education system in the Republic of Albania", article 69 and 70 for violation of legal requirements by private educational institutions, the State Education Inspectorate took two punitive measure for the private school "Flabina" in 2015: a) administrative penalty with a fine of 500 000 ALL for exercising unlicensed activity in the 9-year cycle; b) additional administrative penalty "immediate termination of activity in the 9-year cycle".

Among others, the private educational institution "Flabina" was given as a recommendation to get the approval of the Ministry of Education and Sports for change the location of the school before the beginning of the school year 2015-2016.

In October 2015, the private school "Flabina" was re-examined. The inspection team noted that the private school "Flabina" developed the teaching activity without obtaining the MAS's approval for changing the location. For this reason, it was proposed to remove the license for the activity of the school "Flabina". Minister of Education and Sports with Order no. 82, dated 22.02.2016, ordered the closure of the teaching activity of the four schools belonging to the company "Flabina".¹⁵

¹⁵ Law no. 1008, dated 23.0.2009 "On licenses, authorizations and permits in the Republic of Albania", article 29.

• Law no. 69/2012, dated 21.06.2012, "On the pre-university education system in the Republic of Albania", as amended, Articles 42, 43, 69, 70.

Belarussian case: Violations in activities of educational institutions

Violations in activities of educational institutions most frequently detected by Department of Quality in education (2014-2015).

First of all, insufficient level of legal and managing culture of educational institutions leaders must be mentioned. This insufficiency is revealed in non-performance of requirements of legal acts in the sphere of education.

There are cases of non-performance of requirements of legal acts in the sphere of education.

Some leaders of educational institutions demonstrate low control of implementation of educational programs and standards. As the result, teachers often do not focus on content of the indicated documents while planning educational activities with pupils. There is no clarity in setting goals for a new academic year, neither means, no terms and responsible persons are indicated. Partial ignorance of certain legal acts, their incapability to apply these acts in practice, absence of skills in analysing problems and organizing of study process in this regard serve as negative factors in many teachers' activities.

Some teachers pay little attention to children's body posture, hygienic requirements to lightening of table surface, children's health while placing them in classes.

There are cases of violation of pupils' assessment requirements when some teachers do not put marks, do not give remarks regarding assessment procedure during classes. There is also low level of collecting marks. Cases of unfair assessment are observed as well. Pupils who's knowledge were assessed at a low level («1» and «2») were not interrogated fully in time.

Failure to stick to the schedule of tests is observed somewhere as well. As the result, when the Department organizes tests in separate subjects (aiming at depicting quality and level of pupils' competence), sometimes the results of tests do not comply with semester mark in a subject (mark difference can be up to 3-4 points).

Russian case: Cancellation of accreditation due to poor student academic results

In Russia all educational institutions in all levels of education get license and accreditation. If the license is the confirmation of the right to educational activity, then the accreditation is confirmation of quality of education in a school, college or university.

The purpose of the accreditation examination is to confirm that educational content and academic achievements of students correspond to the State Educational Standards. Students are examined in different school subjects. The accreditation procedure is organized once in 12 years for schools.

There were several cases when schools had showed poor academic results during the examination and their accreditation has been suspended for 6 months. Usually, the school

-
- Instruction no. 15, dated 12.07.2013, of the Minister of Education and Science "On Special Procedures for the Review of License Requests for Private Educational Institutions and Complementary Private Pre-University Educational Institutions".
 - Order no. 82, dated 22.02.2016 of the Minister of Education and Sports "On closing the teaching activity of the institutions of pre-university private education of the society" Flabina"" published in the Official Gazette of the Republic of Albania, 2016, no. 116, p. 8233.
 - State Education Inspectorate Annual Report, 2015, p.29.

faced with such an unpleasant situation repeats tests, improves results and confirms accreditation.

Case 1. In 2016, the accreditation of Lyceum № 1 in Petrozavodsk (Karelian Republic) was suspended. Students failed tests in History, Biology and English. Later Lyceum confirmed accreditation.

Case 2.¹⁶ The school № 874 in Moscow had accreditation examination in December 2010. Students of 9 and 11 grades wrote tests in 12 subjects and showed bad results in 5 of them. The worst results were in Math (54% of students failed), Russian Language (60% failed), Chemistry (68% failed) and Foreign Languages (70% failed). The tests were repeated in January 2011, but the results were equally disastrous. So, The Government of Moscow decided to cancel the accreditation of the school. The school has been disbanded; all students were transferred to another one.

REQUIRED READINGS

Manuals, papers and reports

1. Defining Quality in Education. A paper presented by UNICEF at the meeting of The International Working Group on Education Florence, Italy June 2000.
<https://www.unicef.org/education/files/QualityEducation.PDF>
2. EFA Global Monitoring Report 2005. Understanding education quality
http://www.unesco.org/education/gmr_download/chapter1.pdf
3. European Commission, "European Report on quality of school education, sixteen quality indicators" <http://alex.ifs.hr/pavicic/www.humboldt-club.hr/obrazovanje/euro/school-quality-ind.pdf>
4. European Commission/ EACEA/Eurydice (2015). Assuring quality in education - Policies and approaches to school evaluation in Europe.
http://eacea.ec.europa.eu/education/eurydice/documents/thematic_reports/178en.pdf
5. Supervision: a key component of quality monitoring system, 2007.
<http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0021/002159/215928E.pdf>

Legal acts

6. African Youth Charter, 2006 African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child, 1990. http://www.achpr.org/files/instruments/child/achpr_instr_charterchild_eng.pdf
7. Convention on the Elimination of All Form of Discrimination Against Women, 1979.
<http://www.ohchr.org/Documents/ProfessionalInterest/cedaw.pdf>
8. Convention on the Rights of the Child, 1989.
<http://www.ohchr.org/Documents/ProfessionalInterest/crc.pdf>
9. Council of Europe Recommendation on Ensuring Quality Education, 2012.
https://www.coe.int/t/dg4/linguistic/Source/CMRec2012-13_quality_EN.doc
10. Dakar Framework for Action – Education for All: Meeting our Collective Commitment, 2000. <http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0012/001211/121147e.pdf>
11. Decree of 8 May 2009 concerning the quality of education (Belgium, Flemish Community)
12. Federal Law "On Education in the Russian Federation" No. 273-FZ that was adopted on 29 December 2012 and entered into force on 1 September 2013 Access mode: <http://zakon-ob-obrazovanii.ru>, Date of access: 01/04/2017.

¹⁶ RIA: Russian Information Agency. <https://ria.ru/society/20110121/324546225.html> News for date 21.01.2011

-
13. International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, 1966.
<http://www.ohchr.org/Documents/ProfessionalInterest/cescr.pdf>
 14. Law on Education of the Republic of Lithuania (2011)
 15. Normative provisions for the pre university education system. 2013.
<https://arsimi.gov.al/files/userfiles/.../dispozitat-normative.pdf>
 16. Recommendation of the European Parliament and of the Council of 12 February 2001 on European cooperation in quality evaluation in school education, OJ C 60, 1.3.2001
<https://publications.europa.eu/en/publication-detail/-/publication/702c8772-513f-497a-8e0e-784dfbac9abe/language-en>
 17. Resolution of the Government of the Russian Federation of June 17, 2004, 300
[Electronic resource], Access mode: <http://base.garant.ru/187127>, Date of access: 01/04/2017.
 18. School Education Act of 7 September 1991(Poland)
 19. The Code of Education of the Republic of Belarus dated 13.01.2011 № 243 Adopted by Chamber of Representatives on 02.12.2010, <http://www.pravo.by> (Article 124, Article 125)
 20. The Law no.69/2012, amended, “On Pre-University Education System in the Republic of Albania”. <http://www.arsimi.gov.al/al/newsroom/ligje>
 21. The Law no.8872, date 29.03.2002, amended in 2008, 2011 “On professional education and formation in the Republic of Albania” <http://www.infocip.org/al/?p=6794>
 22. The UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education (1960).
<http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0013/001325/132598e.pdf>
 23. The UNESCO-ILO Recommendation concerning the Status of Teachers (1966).
http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_dialogue/---sector/documents/normativeinstrument/wcms_162034.pdf
 24. Universal Declaration of Human Rights, 1948
 25. World Education Forum (2015). Incheon Declaration. Education2030: Towards inclusive and equitable quality education and lifelong learning for all.
http://uis.unesco.org/sites/default/files/documents/education-2030-incheon-framework-for-action-implementation-of-sdg4-2016-en_2.pdf

SUGGESTED READINGS

26. The 2030 Sustainable Development Goals and the Pursuit of Quality Education for All: A Statement of Support from Education International and ASCD.
<http://www.ascd.org/ASCD/pdf/siteASCD/policy/ASCD-EI-Quality-Education-Statement.pdf>
27. The right to education. Law and policy review guidelines.
<http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0022/002284/228491e.pdf>
28. UNESCO. Beyond the conceptual maze, Occasional papers, 02 March 2012.
<http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0021/002175/217519e.pdf>